



Annex A

Draft Assembly Recommendations as presented on weekend 7 (and subject to technical adjustment)

T1 Enable Scotland to lead	
The Citizens' Assembly recommends that...	
A	... in order to overcome the challenges of relation to... the Scottish Government and Parliament should... have more devolved powers over how the tax system can be made fairer for all citizens and how tax revenue can be used . For example, to become more self-sufficient and have control of industries like fishing and renewal energy, in terms of investment & financial benefits.
B	... in order to overcome the challenges of / citizens can make informed decisions in relation to... the Scottish Government and Parliament should... reduce waste and non-essential use of non-bio-degradable products and be the first to ban these and become a world leader in this area. This must be accompanied by a consistent approach to recycling throughout the country which minimises pollution and the use of landfill.
C	... in order to overcome the challenges of / citizens can make informed decisions in relation to... ..to enable Scotland to lead with integrity, honesty, humility and transparency in a self-sufficient and innovative way the Scottish Government and Parliament should... develop a plan for investment in business in Scotland to secure jobs in the wake of COVID. To concentrate on Scottish small and medium size businesses needing support rather than multinationals. Investment should favour those businesses willing to behave ethically.
D	... in order to overcome the challenges of / citizens can make informed decisions in relation to.....to enable Scotland to lead with integrity, honesty, humility and transparency in a self-sufficient and innovative way the Scottish Government and Parliament should... should ensure the honesty, transparency and integrity of politicians, the existing standards of behaviour should be promoted and strengthened if required, to increase accountability of those elected for their actions within government.
E	... in order to overcome the challenges of / citizens can make informed decisions in relation to.....to enable Scotland to lead with integrity, honesty, humility and transparency in a self-sufficient and innovative way [insert challenge/topic] the Scottish Government and Parliament should... To make further use of citizens assemblies to gather people's views and ideas on issues of national importance eg to involve citizens in reviewing existing legislation in key areas and suggesting which should simplified or reviewed



T2 Include the people of Scotland in decision-making	
The Citizens' Assembly recommends that...	
A	in order to overcome the challenges of citizens' engagement in decision-making the Scottish Government and Parliament should make decisions jointly with citizens through mini assemblies on issues that affect everyone, including all under-represented groups. These should be called at the start of each parliamentary session and be set up to examine specific issues. Their recommendations must be debated in Parliament before the assemblies are disbanded.
B	in order to overcome the challenges of citizens' engagement in decision-making the Scottish Government and Parliament should set up a 'house of citizens' to scrutinise government proposals and give assent to parliamentary bills. Membership should be time-limited and representative of the population of Scotland, similar to the way this CA was selected. There should be an oversight body to ensure this.
C	in order to overcome the challenges of citizens' engagement in decision-making the Scottish Government and Parliament should set up a citizens' committee in Scottish Parliament. This would be a randomly selected body, with members being encouraged and supported to take part. It would offer advice and opinions on government proposals, review the work of parliament and hold the government to account. It would be for a fixed term with members receiving a gift of thanks.
D	in order to overcome the challenges of citizens' engagement in decision-making the Scottish Government and Parliament should encourage MSPs to act on the views of their constituents, rather than sticking with party lines. They should actively consult with constituents on matters which may have an impact on their community and on matters about which a significant number of constituents have shown concern.

T3 People and government communicate with each other	
The Citizens' Assembly recommends that...	
A	...in order to overcome the challenges of having citizens influence changing laws and making decisions Scottish Government and Parliament should make more use of Citizens Assemblies to involve communities and citizens in deliberating on major policies. They should be used regularly. There should be an independent body to make the decision on when and on what topics - when politicians cannot come to agreement, and to ensure accountability for follow up.
B	... in order to overcome the challenges of the lack of public trust in politicians the Scottish Government and Parliament should appoint a non-political independent review body to do a forensic investigation to deliver: <ul style="list-style-type: none">• a more accountable parliament with acceptable standards of behaviour• responsibility for delivery on commitments



	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• faster public access to information on what is happening• acknowledgement of all those who supported society during Covid
C	... in order to overcome the challenge of Government sharing good quality, honest information with the public Scottish Government and Parliament should make an annual presentation of major commitments and policies and progress against them. Presented simply and without jargon. Pitched at a level that is accessible but meaningful using media channels in a non-biased and honest way as a true representation of what is happening and what is on-going.

T4 Publication of information

The Citizens' Assembly recommends that...

A	The Citizens Assembly recommends that in order to overcome the challenges of publishing information that is valid, accurate, reliable, verifiable and accessible to all the Scottish Government and Parliament should regularly publish all tax-payer funded documentation (including legislation, research, expert advice, curriculums, etc.) in a free and publicly available space with all relevant links and sources attached in formats that are easily understandable and searchable.
B	The Citizen's Assembly recommends that in order to overcome the challenges of providing equal internet access to all the Scottish Government and Parliament should invest in infrastructure (and utilise existing infrastructure) to widen mobile networks and remove black spots, ensuring all communities have access to internet through free community hot-spots and publicly available hardware. Internet should be considered as a basic need, free to all.
C	The Citizen's Assembly recommends that in order to overcome the challenges of publishing information that is valid, accurate, reliable, verifiable and accessible to all through a national database the Scottish Government and Parliament should financially invest in national and community libraries and a complementary online library to house all Scottish Government information for the public domain which is easy to search and accessible for all.
D	The Citizen's Assembly recommends that in order to overcome the challenges of ensuring transparency is maintained the Scottish Government and Parliament should treat the public as equals and publish all relevant information which informs local and national government decisions in one central location which is easily searchable and cross-referenced. Information should be available for all (e.g. in other languages and in formats suitable for people with disabilities such as using screen readers).

T5 Supporting young people

The Citizens' Assembly recommends that...



A	... in order to overcome the challenges of young people's mental health issues the Scottish Government and Parliament should fund compulsory, permanent mental health support liaison officers in every school, increase and ring-fence funding for CAMHS and better support for the transition into adult mental health services.
B	... in order to overcome the challenges of affordable and quality housing the Scottish Government and Parliament should work with councils and other stakeholders, including tenant associations (such as Living Rent), to implement rent caps across the country, give all young people entitlement to affordable social housing, simplify the information available to young people about welfare support for housing, strictly enforce rules for landlords, including housing associations, to maintain good quality repair of housing, and make buying property more accessible.
C	... in order to overcome the challenges of young people's unemployment and underemployment the Scottish Government and Parliament should create more apprenticeships and increase apprentice wages, guarantee further opportunities at the end of college training courses and apprenticeships, including through employer incentives, and create an apprenticeship database for employers to find qualified young people.
D	... in order to overcome the challenges of poverty the Scottish Government and Parliament should raise the minimum wage for young people aged 16-24 to a national living wage
E	... in order to overcome the challenges of young people's health and wellbeing the Scottish Government and Parliament should invest in and provide opportunities for all young people to access extra-curricular activities, including sports and the arts, with support and guidance for young people to pursue opportunities that are right for them
F	... in order to overcome the challenges of a healthy work-life balance the Scottish Government and Parliament should investigate the feasibility of a four day working week

T6	Enable everyone to reach their full potential
	The Citizens' Assembly recommends that...
A	... in order to overcome the challenges of universal social responsibility and inclusion the Scottish Government and Parliament should ethically invest in our society by ensuring everyone has a central bank account provided at birth for every citizen (example:£1000 which cannot be spent until you reach a certain age) contributed to on a regular basis throughout a citizens lifetime by means of Universal Basic Income, which provides a real living income to ensure people don't worry about food, living costs and create our own model of working by blending our own ideas with the best tried and tested methods from other countries.
B	... citizens can make informed decisions in relation to how citizens self-empower the Scottish Government and Parliament should guarantee free education for life as a right and not a privilege that vocational studies/life-skills are compulsory beginning at primary school, apprenticeships open to all ages including a voluntary



	national service scheme supporting education, health or other key national services.
C	... in order to overcome the challenges of building a truly integrated society which works in the best interest of everyone, ensuring its needs are met ethically, morally and legally by individuals, corporations and government and these should be supported, protected, nurtured and financed fairly by all. The Scottish Government and Parliament should legislate upon clear and simple standards and ways of working (for example, IT and public information systems) to improve collaboration, accessibility and communication locally and nationally, which achieves cost efficiencies, and streamlines services and working practices across both private and public organisations to ensure they are understood by all and run for the benefit of citizens.

T7	Standard of living and opportunities The Citizens' Assembly recommends that...
A	in order to overcome the challenges of in work poverty the Scottish Government and parliament should make the payment of a living wage a legal requirement for all employers.
B	in order to overcome the challenges of unstable work and low incomes the Scottish Government and parliament should work with Westminster to make zero hours contracts illegal
C	in order to overcome the challenges of unemployment the Scottish Government and Parliament should work with Westminster to lower the age of the state pension, ensuring that retiring at state pension age is not enforced by employers.

T8	Leaders in innovation The Citizens' Assembly recommends that...
A	... in order to overcome the challenges of growing Scottish industry sustainably the Scottish Government and Parliament should: <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Identify and invest in industries conducive to making Scotland a global leader and a hub for scientific and tech. innovation• Build on Scotland's scientific, industrial and technological strengths and its extensive natural resources



	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Have a strong innovative leadership and culture that takes the necessary action to motivate and allow others to realise their aspirations and ability
B	<p>... in order to overcome the challenges of encouraging individuals and companies to engage in the process of innovation, the Scottish Government and Parliament should:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Invest and incentivise through research grants and tax breaks etc
C	<p>... in order to overcome the challenges of ensuring that the very best and most talented people and businesses in the new technological industries are located in Scotland, the Scottish Government and Parliament should:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Establish more centres of excellence in new technologies in every area of Scotland. For example, the Rowatt Institute in Aberdeen and Roslin Innovation Centre• Inspire children from an early age to have an interest in, and to consider a career in, science and technology. This would be achieved through education and other initiatives such as an educational theme park like the Epcot Centre

T9	Fairer taxation: Simplified and proportionate
	The Citizens' Assembly recommends that...
A	<p>... in order to overcome the challenges of the tax gap the Scottish Government and Parliament should provide legislation and power to a proactive, independent, specialist body that is responsible for finding evaders and avoiders of tax, with power to recover tax due.</p>
B	<p>... in order to overcome the challenges of adverse business practices the Scottish Government and Parliament should develop tax incentives for all businesses to encourage good employment practices such as:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• good environmental choices;• higher salaries/wages so that people have more money to spend in the Scottish economy;• apprenticeships and opportunities for young school leavers and graduates in trades and skills as well as academic pursuits;• large businesses being motivated to invest in research to contribute to creating jobs;• invest in and develop workforce skills (engineering and new industries like green energy, entrepreneurial skills, etc).



T10 Fairer taxation: Transparent and understandable	
The Citizens' Assembly recommends that...	
A	...the Scottish government/parliament should Provide an information hub for everyone about tax and why it is important. Individuals should be signposted to this hub when they receive their National Insurance number
B	... in order to overcome the challenges of understanding tax the Scottish Government and Parliament should... Publish a register of organisations which shows compliance with tax and employment measures using the green/amber/red system.
C	... in order to overcome the challenges of understanding tax the Scottish Government and Parliament should... Appoint a credible, engaging and independent figure who can communicate government tax and spending information every quarter in a way that involves and educates the public. This could be done by creating a public information post using graphics and delivered either in person or using characters and voice overs through animation.
D	... in order to overcome the challenges of understanding tax the Scottish Government and Parliament should... Provide a public statement available on all platforms from the Finance Minister every quarter about how taxes of all types have been spent and what remains in all budgets.

T11 Fairer taxation: Green and sustainable	
The Citizens' Assembly recommends that...	
A	... in order to overcome the challenges of how people can contribute to a sustainable future the Scottish Government and Parliament should educate the public that we all need to play a role in saving the planet and contributing to a sustainable future. They should raise awareness through an approved government website of the changes people can make (including schemes they can benefit from, support available and behavioural changes).
B	... in order to overcome the challenges of protecting the energy that can be produced in Scotland the Scottish Government and Parliament should invest in, and incentivise wider investment in, the infrastructure that will enable us to harness our renewable energy resources to their full potential, including improved distribution and storage capacity.
C	... in order to overcome the challenges facing high streets and the sustainability of Scottish businesses the Scottish Government and Parliament should investigate how best to support and give tax breaks to small local businesses who are impacted most by Covid 19, to urgently help them begin to participate in a green recovery and encourage new local business to open with green values



D	... in order to overcome the challenges of providing sustainable, affordable housing the Scottish Government and Parliament should make it easier and cheaper for people to invest in the energy efficiency of their houses (particularly the upgrading of older houses) by subsidising the costs of eco-friendly building materials for everyone (eg VAT reductions, government grants or schemes, or capped pricing) so that it encourages the use of these types of materials.
---	---

T12 Support people out of poverty	
The Citizens' Assembly recommends that...	
A	... in order to overcome the challenges of Scotland's poverty, the Scottish Government and Parliament should set up a task force to overcome poverty - there should be one in each council area and with guidelines from government including fair representation of citizens affected by poverty on the task force.
B	... in order to that citizens can make informed decisions in relation to defining poverty the Scottish Government and Parliament should... Ask citizens 3 questions: -Do you have a roof over your head? -Can you heat your house? -Will you be able to put hot food on the table? If the answer is no, you are in poverty.
C	... in order that citizens can make informed decisions in relation preventing poverty the Scottish Government and Parliament should identify issues that lead people falling into poverty and intercept people before they reach poverty. e.g. address job losses, push for the abolishment of zero hour contracts etc.
D	... in order to overcome the challenges of working poverty, the Scottish Government and Parliament should push for the abolishment of the zero hour contract, make companies more flexible and accountable and have all companies pay staff at least the living wage.
E	... in order to that citizens can make informed decisions in relation to support for poverty the Scottish Government and Parliament should require the 32 local councils to establish local task forces and appoint a poverty representative as a bridge between local and national level.
F	in order to overcome the challenges of / failure to deliver on policy the Scottish Government and Parliament should be held accountable and consequences in place when goals are not met.

T13a Health and social care (A)	
The Citizens' Assembly recommends that...	



A	in order to overcome the challenges of current ineffective health promotion and education to support people to live healthier, The Scottish Government and Parliament should invest in research on why this is, to what extent people know about support available and what would help people to utilise local facilities, groups, services that exist. A range of support and services should be available to all that need or want them for example cooking skills, exercise classes, healthy lifestyle forums.
---	---

T13b	Health and social care (B)
The Citizens' Assembly recommends that...	
A	... in order to overcome the challenges of NHS's over dependency on Agency staff the Scottish Government and Parliament should... Ensure that all NHS staff receive higher wages and enhanced employment packages to facilitate the retention of staff and strengthen recruitment.
B	... in order that citizens can make informed decisions about the underfunding of health despite 50% of tax going towards it the Scottish Government and Parliament should make people more aware of how much the NHS costs them at an individual level and use examples to highlight these costs (such as invoices) to build a sense of value and respect for the service...
C	... in order to overcome the challenges of dominance of management/ business consultants in the NHS the Scottish Government and Parliament should ensure that there is a higher proportion of medically trained staff and the inclusion of community members at management/board level...
D	... in order to overcome the challenges of hospitals doing everything and being inaccessible for many the Scottish Government and Parliament should create social and minor health care hubs in the community in order to build proactive community resilience but also to reduce the strain on hospitals. These hubs could be available for, for example: Drugs, Alcohol, Smoking, Healthy eating, physiotherapy, Mental Health groups ...
E	... in order to overcome the challenges of creeping privatisation of the NHS the Scottish Government and Parliament should be transparent about contracts or services that are being passed over to private companies. ...

T14	Scotland to have more powers
The Citizens' Assembly recommends that...	
A	... in order to overcome the challenges of Scotland raising more of its own income the Scottish Government and Parliament should explore how it can gain greater powers to gather, keep and use more tax income from companies based in Scotland, and from products such as Whisky, Fishing Industries, Oil, Tourism and Energy, etc,



B	... in order to overcome the challenges of Scotland being restricted in its ability to make trade agreements and develop international relations the Scottish Government and Parliament should seek to gain greater powers which would allow us to negotiate and agree our own International and trade relations
C	... in order that citizens can make informed decisions in relation to Scotland's diverse community and workforce the Scottish Government and Parliament should work and negotiate with the UK government and others to seek to gain maximum control, and be able to manage, its own immigration laws and arrangements to the benefit of Scotland and its people

T15	Looking after the most vulnerable The Citizens' Assembly recommends that...
A	... in order to overcome the challenges of looking after every person in society the Scottish Government and Parliament should undertake a root and branch review of public services in order to prioritise good mental health care and holistic wellbeing for every individual through education, awareness, person-centred care and appropriate resourcing
B	... in order to overcome the challenges of building a stronger, fairer and more equal Scotland the Scottish Government and Parliament should implement the recommendations of the existing Social Renewal Advisory Board and measure it against the National Performance Framework
C	... in order that citizens can make informed decisions in relation to rebuilding their communities the Scottish Government and Parliament should establish community-based citizens' assemblies to assess what is happening in our communities (including the effects of COVID), identify gaps and recommend actions, including through digital technology, that can bring people together and make our communities more inclusive
D	... in order that citizens can make informed decisions in relation to criminal justice reform the Scottish Government and Parliament should undertake a full review of the criminal justice system to improve outcomes for communities, offenders and victims. This would include reintroduction of community policing, involving citizens in improving local communications and services.